



Remuneration System Satisfaction Analysis and Its Affecting Factors (Case Study on Specialist-Physician at Government Hospital in Jakarta)

*Citra Sari Pratiwi and Andreasta Meliala

Faculty of Medicine, Public Health and Nursing, Universitas Gadjah Mada , Yogyakarta, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: citrasari1288@gmail.com

Submitted: July 2021

Reviewed: March 2023

Publish: March 2023

Abstract

Background: Remuneration is an important strategy to improve the competence of hospital services. Remuneration aims to motivate employees which can be achieved if the remuneration system is implemented fairly, but the gap between the ratio of the number of doctors and the average points to rates causes' physician dissatisfaction toward the remuneration system. Analyze satisfaction level and measure remuneration satisfaction factors on Pediatricians and Obstetrics and Gynecologists at ABC Hospital Jakarta.

Materials and Methods: This study used quantitative methods with multiple linear regression analysis measured by the Equity Scale and Remuneration Satisfaction Scale. Interviews were used to obtain comprehensive analysis results from respondents who were in the lower and upper limits of the questionnaire results. The interview also involved the management of ABC Hospital Jakarta. **Results:** Total 44 respondents consisting of 30 Pediatricians and 14 Obstetricians and Gynecologists, showed dissatisfaction with the remuneration system (45,46%), neutral (31,53%), and satisfied (23%). There was a relationship between perceptions of external fairness ($P= 0,003$) and procedural fairness ($P= 0,002$) with remuneration satisfaction. There was no relationship between perceptions of internal justice ($P= 0,929$) and perceptions of individual justice ($P= 0,130$) with remuneration satisfaction. These results were explored using interviews and the causes of doctor dissatisfaction due to the gap in the achievement of the Individual Performance Index, lots of doctor examinations that were not listed in the rates, and remuneration points did not consider the complexity of each job. Meanwhile, the dissatisfaction felt by the management was due to the lack of measurement of quality indicators in the remuneration system. **Conclusion:** External and procedural justices are factors that affect the satisfaction of remuneration felt by specialist-physician. The remuneration obtained at ABC Hospital Jakarta is lower than other Government Hospitals of the same type. In addition, there are binding rules, doctors' lack of understanding of the remuneration system, and lack of socialization. The management needs to formulate a more detailed remuneration system based on applicable regulations by adjusting the hospital situation.

Keywords: Justice, remuneration satisfaction, specialist-physician

1. Introduction

The role of specialist-physician in the hospital is very important. Physicians devote their energy, time, knowledge and skills in helping to achieve hospital goals, thus every medical worker deserves compensation as a reward for what has been produced (1). The social and financial compensation provided is an effort to support the hospital to achieve high performance. In that order, compensation instruments must be developed as a motivator for employees to work harder (2).

Remuneration must be fair and reasonable by considering four principles, namely, external justice, internal justice, individual justice and procedural justice (3). Assuming that one or more of the four justices is not fulfilled will result in employee dissatisfaction. In the 2018 ABC Jakarta Hospital performance report, it was stated that the main problem in Human Resources (HR) is that the remuneration system has not created the welfare expected by employees. This background is the basis for analyzing the level of remuneration satisfaction and the factors related to remuneration satisfaction in the Functional Medical Specialist group.

2. Materials and Methods

This study used a quantitative method with multiple linear regression analysis, measuring the justice scale and the remuneration satisfaction scale on specialist-physician at ABC Hospital Jakarta, which is a type A vertical hospital owned by the Government. Respondents were measured using a Likert scale from 1-5, from strongly disagree to strongly agree. The research

population was 30 Pediatricians and 14 Obstetricians and Gynecologists at ABC Hospital Jakarta in 2021. Quantitative data analysis was carried out using SPSS 23 software. There are four independent variables, namely, external justice, internal justice, individual justice, and procedural justice, while the dependent variable is remuneration satisfaction. The measurement results were deepened with the interview method in order to get a comprehensive explanation from the management and respondents who were in the lower and upper limits of the survey results. Qualitative data were analyzed using the content analysis method.

3. Results

The validity test was measured by looking at the correlation between the scores of each question item per variable. SPSS software version 23 was used for calculations with the Pearson Correlation formula. The validity of all items shows the significance level of all items is less than 0,05 which means all questions are valid. The reliability test used Cronbach's Alpha method showed that the reliability of the questionnaire was good; the five variables had a coefficient of α (alpha) above 0,60. These results indicate that the question model is able to provide consistency of answers and can be used in research.

Total of 44 respondents at ABC Hospital Jakarta consisting of 30 Pediatricians and 14 Obstetricians and Gynecologists. Characteristics of respondents are distinguished by gender, age, workplace unit, type of specialist-physician, employment status, years of service, and location of doctor practice.

Table 1. Characteristics of respondents

Characteristics of Respondents	Total (n)	Percentage
Age		
< 30 years	0	0%
31 - 40 years	16	36,4%
41 - 50 years	10	22,7%
51 - 60 years	15	34,1%
> 60 years	3	6,8%
Workplace Unit		
Polyclinic	24	54,5%
ICU/NICU	8	18,2%
Polyclinic and ICU/NICU	12	27,3%

Type of specialist-physician		
Pediatrician	30	68,2%
Obstetrics and gynecology	14	31,8%
Employment Status		
Government employees	38	86,4%
Non-Government employees	6	13,6%
Years of Service		
0 - 8 years	19	43,2%
9 - 16 years	15	34,1%
> 25 years	10	22,7%
Practice Location		
Only Work at ABC Hospital		
Jakarta	6	13,6%
Work at another hospital	38	86,4%

Table 2. Description of remuneration satisfaction variable

Indicator	Frequency					
	SD*	D*	N*	A*	SA*	
Eligible / Reasonable	Remuneration according to workload	15,9%	25%	36,4%	20,5%	2,3%
	Remuneration according to performance	20,5%	29,5%	22,7%	22,7%	4,5%
	Remuneration meets the cost of living standards	13,6%	18,2%	47,7%	18,2%	2,3%
Fair / Balanced	Grading considers competence/ability	18,2%	20,5%	27,3%	34,1%	0%
	Grading considers years of service/work experience	11,4%	20,5%	34,1%	34,1%	0%
	Remuneration for each grade according to the job load	15,9%	18,2%	43,2%	20,5%	2,3%
Acceptable	Transparency of remuneration pattern	36,4%	22,7%	22,7%	18,2%	0%
	The remuneration setting pattern is in line with my expectations	27,3%	34,1%	22,7%	13,6%	2,3%
	Acceptable remuneration and grading pattern	22,7%	25,0%	36,4%	13,6%	2,3%
Enough	The amount of remuneration can meet the needs	15,9%	31,8%	29,5%	20,5%	2,3%
	The amount of remuneration provides more value for saving	25%	27,3%	27,3%	18,2%	2,3%

*SD: Strongly disagree, D: Disagree, N: Neutral, A: Agree, SA: Strongly agree

Based on table 2 the results of the answers based on the variable of remuneration satisfaction show that respondents answered

neutral 31,53%, disagreed 45,46%, while agree or satisfied 23%.

Table 3. Tabulation of characteristics of respondents with satisfaction with remuneration

	Indicator	Frequency				
		SD	D	N	A	SA
Age	31-40 years	2,27%	20,45%	9,09%	4,54%	0%
	41-50 years	0%	11,36%	4,54%	4,54%	0%
	51-60 years	4,54%	15,90%	9,09%	6,81%	0%
	> 60 years	0%	2,27%	2,27%	2,27%	0%
Workplace Unit	ICU/NICU	4,54%	11,36%	2,27%	0%	0%
	Poliklinik	2,27%	27,27%	11,36%	13,63%	0%
	Poliklinik dan ICU/NICU	0%	11,36%	11,36%	4,54%	0%
Type of Specialist-Physician	Anak	6,81%	38,63%	11,36%	11,36%	0%
	ObGyn	0%	11,36%	13,63%	6,81%	0%
Employment Status	PNS	6,81%	43,18%	22,72%	13,63%	0%
	Non-PNS	0%	6,81%	2,27%	4,54%	0%
Years of Service	0-8 years	4,54%	9,09%	18,18%	11,36%	0%
	9-16 years	2,27%	13,63%	13,63%	4,54%	0%
	>25 years	4,54%	2,27%	9,09%	6,81%	0%

*SD: Strongly disagree, D: Disagree, N: Neutral, A: Agree, SA: Strongly agree

Interview with management regarding the achievement of remuneration points based on the comparison between the remuneration received and the amount of service shows that

the constraint on remuneration is the implementation of the point system by rate.

Table 4. Obstacles in the remuneration system at ABC Hospital

Obstacle	Explanation
Achievement of Individual Performance Index (called Indeks Kinerja Individu/ IKI)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Many members of the Functional Medical Specialist achieve IKI 3 or maximum IKI, but this achievement does not affect the increase in revenue at ABC Jakarta Hospital. 2. Doctors who provide minimal service, especially Pediatricians, have difficulty achieving the maximum IKI, while doctors who provide a lot of service reach the maximum IKI faster because they collect more points. 3. The maximum IKI can be achieved in the middle of the month, thus causing demotivation as further work is not counted as a value or award. 4. In case that the maximum IKI has been reached, the excess points are distributed to colleagues without notice to the management.
Remuneration value	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The high number of patients does not guarantee that doctors get high remuneration. Meanwhile, doctors who provide few services at high rates get high remuneration. 2. Even though doctors have high position values, their remuneration income still depends on hospital revenue. 3. Doctors hope that there is no limit to the number of services and a maximum payable rate limit for remuneration.

Service rates	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Many rates for services are not listed, so doctors only estimate rates by adjusting rates for similar services.2. There has been no change in the value of service tariffs in the last 5 years.3. Several services in the ICU room should have a separate rate and not be included in the package.
Remuneration points	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Management has not calculated the working hours in the ICU room outside the working hours of civil servants, but the number of points awarded is the same as the work done during working hours.2. Doctors feel they are not being treated fairly because the remuneration points for providing services at the executive polyclinic during working hours are of the same value as handling regular patients or patients using health insurance/ BPJS.3. The basic target points are the same for all specialist-physician.

The table shows that there are four major themes of obstacles to the remuneration system with a point system based on rates, i.e., obstacles in achieving the Individual Performance Index, the amount of remuneration obtained is not in line with the expectations of the specialist-physician, service rates are not appropriate, and the determination of remuneration points.

4. Discussion

Characteristics of respondents by age, 16 respondents (36,4%) are under 40 years old, 10 respondents (22,7%) are 41-50 years old, 15 respondents (34,1%) are 51-60 years old, and 3 respondents (6,8%) over 60 years. The total response that is dissatisfied with the remuneration system is 45,46% and a larger percentage of young respondents indicate that dissatisfaction with the system is due to their young age. This is in line with the results of the research on job satisfaction of nurses, that the older the respondent, the more satisfied they are at work compared to younger respondents (4). In an in-depth interview, one of the interviewees also mentioned that there is an age gap of up to 10 years between junior doctors and senior doctors.

There are 24 respondents (54,5%) who only work in polyclinics with minimal service. This background causes 45,46% of respondents to be dissatisfied with the remuneration using a point system based on tariffs, which means that services with large tariffs will get big points which facilitate the achievement of the maximum point target.

On the characteristics of years of service, 19 respondents (43,2%) had less than 8 years of service, 15 respondents (34,1%) had 9-16 years of service, while 10 respondents (22,7%) had years of service between 16 to 25 years. This shows that doctors with less than 16 years of service tend to be dissatisfied with the remuneration system at ABC Hospital Jakarta. These results are reinforced by Dessler's statement that junior employees tend to be less satisfied than senior employees because junior employees have high expectations that are not possible to be fulfilled in the near future⁽³⁾. The results of this study also show that doctors at ABC Hospital Jakarta also work in other hospitals with a total of 38 respondents (86,4%).

This was confirmed by one of the informants as follows:

"Our fellow junior doctors agree that we do not only work at ABC Hospital Jakarta. We only work as civil servants during working hours, maybe only 1 or 2 colleagues who work outside working hours. But it's different with the seniors."

(Resource Person 1)

The lack of specialist-physician monoloyalty at ABC Hospital Jakarta will affect the hospital's income. Monoloyalty is one of the methods used in the 2015 study, where regulations were drawn up for Functional Medical Specialists whose working period of less than five years are categorized as monoloyalty doctors, they are not allowed to work as part-time doctors outside the hospital. However, they have the right to obtain educational scholarships, professional insurance, as well as additional health financing in addition to health insurance (5). This strategy can be considered for ABC Hospital Jakarta as a way to increase revenue. Research and education are considered important in improving the quality of the best care for patients, both through formal education programs and training. Sense of responsibility towards the work itself and a sense of humanity or interest in patients that keeps employees performing well (5). This reason is in line with the expectations and goals of specialist-physician doctors to work at ABC Hospital Jakarta.

"No one forces us, in Indonesia there is no obligation for us to work in government hospitals. Become a civil servant in order to get a school scholarship. We should be aware that ABC hospital is not a place for us to make money. The money earned is not comparable to working full-time in a private hospital."

(Resource Person 1)

However, if ABC Hospital Jakarta wants to implement monoloyalty, the hospital must ensure the suitability of the income of each doctor based on competence and performance. Remuneration or compensation can affect employee motivation as well as improve performance, because good remuneration attracts employees to work harder. Compensation or rewards will have an effect on

increasing work motivation which in turn will directly improve individual performance (5).

One of the specialist-physicians in the interview session stated that if ABC Hospital Jakarta wants to increase hospital revenue, it must improve private polyclinics or executive polyclinics. Specialist-physician complained that points in service delivery were measured the same between executive and regular polyclinics. *"We have a lot of patients in the executive polyclinic. However, the executive polyclinic is open during regular working hours. Supposedly, the remuneration points of service for executive patients are different from regular patients."*

(Resource Person 3)

The improvement of the point system in the executive polyclinic is expected to attract specialist-physician to practice. This strategy can provide additional value for hospital pay, because ABC Jakarta hospital as a Public Service Agency gets the flexibility to implement healthy business practices including remuneration. The aim is to improve services to the community in order to promote general welfare and educate the nation's life in accordance with Government Regulation 23/2005 concerning Public Service Agencies.

The results showed that 35.6% of respondents answered neutral to the appropriate/reasonable indicator. However, based on the answers agree and disagree, then 40.9% of respondents tend to answer disagree that the remuneration system is in accordance with the workload and performance, and can meet the cost of living standards. If it is associated with in-depth interviews with 2 specialist-physicians who said that in general the remuneration system has not provided satisfaction in terms of amount, transparency, and calculation method. The remuneration system and medical rates at ABC Hospital Jakarta are not appropriate, lots service rates have not been registered in the system and some service rates should be separate but included in the package. This has not been accepted by specialist-physician, especially ICU doctors, even though the achievement of remuneration has been very good.

"Like when doing intubation, we do services but they are not counted, because the intubation service is included in the package. Even though in the textbook it is written that the intubation service in the pediatric intensive care room gets this rate of payment."

(Resource Person 2)

On the fair/balanced indicator 34.8% of respondents answered neutral. However, if based on a comparison of the answers agree and disagree, it shows that 29.57% of respondents answered agree that the determination of the grading is in accordance with the competence/ability, years of service/experience, and the amount of remuneration for each level is in accordance with the workload. This is because ABC Hospital Jakarta is a government hospital that follows the Minister of Health Regulation no. 1683/MENKES/PER/XII/2005 concerning Organization and Work Procedures, ABC Hospital Jakarta as the technical implementing unit of the Ministry of Health applies performance-based remuneration, and follows the Minister of Finance Decree no. 374/KMK V/2014 concerning Determination of Remuneration for Management Officers, Supervisory Boards and Hospital Employees. One resource person stated, *"But there is a difference between me who worked for less than 10 years and senior doctors with a dozen years of work experience. I don't mind the difference, as long as it's clearly written, of course we can accept it."*

(Resource Person 3)

In line with Milkovich, that one of the factors that affects the reward system is the legislation. The existence of rules or regulations can guarantee that the right person gets the right payment to achieve the right goal in the right way (7). On the indicators of an acceptable remuneration system, 28.8% of respondents answered strongly disagree that the pattern of determining the remuneration system is delivered transparently, the pattern of determining the remuneration is as expected, and the pattern of determining the amount of remuneration, as well as determining the grading. Several resource persons stated that many doctors did not understand the components and how to calculate the remuneration system.

"Maybe I don't really understand and I didn't attend the meeting at the beginning of determining the remuneration. There are points P1, P2, P3, which I don't understand in detail"

(Resource Person 3)

However, the management and policy makers stated that they have carried out socialization so that doctors can get a good understanding of the remuneration system.

"The remuneration team actively provides socialization to their friends. From the top level to the bottom have sufficient understanding. There are meaningless upheavals, a few protests and they can be resolved, and that's individual."

(Policy Formulator)

"We already have regular socialization. But doctors rarely attend meetings because they are busy at the polyclinic. This is an obstacle. We think it has been carried out transparently, but doctors think otherwise because they did not attend the meeting."

(Head of the Remuneration Preparation Team)

In fact, if the employee does not understand the mechanism for giving an assessment of performance, as well as the details of the position and status in the level of position value, it will lead to dissatisfaction, suspicion, and social jealousy among employees (7). Efforts that can be made by the management are routine and ongoing socialization, internal notes or through the Management Information System which can be accessed at any time.

On the indicator of sufficient in remuneration satisfaction, 29.55% of respondents answered disagree that the amount of remuneration can meet the needs of life and provide more value so that they can save. These results are in line with the characteristics of respondents that 86.4% of respondents work in other hospitals. This shows that respondents need additional income other than what they get from ABC Hospital Jakarta.

"Compared to the income in private hospitals, let's say my monthly income at ABC Hospital Jakarta by working 8 hours every day and

servicing many patients with difficult cases, is the same as the income in 2 weeks at a private hospital with less patients"

(Resource Person 1)

The difference in the income of doctors in government hospitals with those in private hospitals is due to differences in the system applied. ABC Hospital Jakarta follows government regulations, in particular KMK 374/2014 which states that the highest total remuneration has been set (5). However, one resource person stated that the income of doctors at other government hospitals of the same type was different from the income at ABC Hospital Jakarta.

"Our remuneration is lower if I compare it to other hospitals of the same level or other government hospitals. In fact, the level of difficulty of service to patients is more or less the same".

(Resource Person 3)

This causes dissatisfaction among specialist-physician to the remuneration system at ABC Hospital Jakarta.

5. Conclusion

Based on the results of the analysis of remuneration satisfaction and influencing factors at ABC Hospital, the following conclusions can be drawn :

1. ABC Hospital is a type-A vertical hospital as a Technical Implementation Unit of the Ministry of Health which is a Public Service Agency. ABC Hospital Jakarta implements a remuneration system based on regulations from the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia.
2. The implementation of the remuneration system at ABC Hospital Jakarta is carried out by collecting data for payments, such as employee data according to position value, attendance, employee salaries, remuneration tables, and employee performance. Furthermore, in the process, the remuneration components are calculated so that they get a list of salaries (P1), incentives (P2), and allowances (P3).
3. The results of the remuneration satisfaction survey can be concluded that 45,46% of

Pediatricians and Obstetricians and Gynecologists at ABC Hospital stated that they were not satisfied with the implementation of the remuneration system, especially the transparency of the remuneration determination pattern and the pattern of determination that was not in accordance with their expectations.

4. Perceptions of external justice ($P = 0,003$) and perceptions of procedural justice ($P = 0,002$) are factors that influence the satisfaction of specialist doctors' remuneration at ABC Hospital Jakarta.
5. The results of the cross tabulation of the characteristics of respondents with remuneration satisfaction showed that the majority did not agree that remuneration satisfaction was fulfilled based on age in the age range of 31-40 years, a total of 10 respondents (22,72%), polyclinic workplace units were 13 respondents (29,54%), types of specialization which is pediatrician are 20 respondents (45,44%), civil servant are 22 respondents (49,99%), and working period of 9-16 years are 7 respondents (15,9%).
6. In line with the results of the interview that the causes of specialist-physician dissatisfaction with the remuneration system are divided into 4 major themes, i.e., the gap in the achievement of the Individual Performance Index, the remuneration value obtained, the action rates are not appropriate and the remuneration point value is not in line with the doctor's expectations. Though there are obstacles in the remuneration system of ABC Hospital Jakarta, the specialist-physicians work according to their portions, as they really understand that ABC Hospital is a government hospital that complies with regulations.

6. Suggestion

From the results of this study, there are several suggestions :

1. ABC Hospital Jakarta management needs to maximize the performance of the remuneration team in formulating the remuneration system by considering external and procedural justice elements. These two justice factors are factors that affect the

satisfaction of the remuneration system at ABC Hospital Jakarta.

2. The Weighing factor in job evaluation must be specific reflecting the functional complexity of the medical profession working in hospitals.
3. Job analysis needs to be more specific, not only distinguishing medical and medical specialists, but also classification based on the weight of compensable factors for each profession.
4. The value of the point system on individual performance appraisal needs to be reconsidered according to the complexity of each profession.
5. Performance measurement indicators really have to be calculated, especially quality indicators.
6. Evaluation of PIR value is carried out once a year.
7. Evaluation of performance targets is carried out periodically at least once every 3 months, especially quality indicators
8. Evaluation of the calculation of the tariff per action based on the medical service reference of specialist doctors from The Indonesian Medical Association
9. Developed more organizational communication strategy, especially micro approach in organizational communication
10. Maximizing executive polyclinics so that specialist doctors are happy to practice in there and monoloyalty for doctors whose working period is less than 5 years.

Suggestions for further research are as follows :

1. It is necessary to evaluate the remuneration system for all hospital employess.
2. It is necessary to use a mixed methods research design so that it can reveal more qualitatively about remuneration justice and also direct observation at the research site.
3. Further research was conducted at ABC Hospital on organizational communication management.

References

1. Yuliyanto, H., Santosa, E. Persepsi dan Ekspektasi Dokter Terhadap Jasa Medis di RS PKU Muhammadiyah Nanggulan. *Journal of Medico Legal and Hospital Management Vol. 4,*

No. 1/ 2015

2. Ilyas, Y. (2012). *Kinerja Teori, Penilaian dan Penelitian*. Jakarta: FKM UI Health Economics Study Center
3. Dessler, G. (2008). *Human Resource Management*. America : Prentice Hall
4. Akustia, E. (2001). Pengaruh Karakteristik dan Faktor Kondisi Pekerjaan dengan Kepuasan Kerja Perawat di Kabupaten Pati. *Diponegoro University Institutional Repository*.
5. Soetisna, T.W. Ayuningtyas, D. Misnaniarti. Penerapan Sistem Remunerasi dan Kinerja Pelayanan. *Jurnal Kesehatan Masyarakat Nasional Vol. 10*
6. Milkovich, G. Newman, J. Gerhart, B. (2014). *Compensation 11th edition*. New York: McGraw Hill.
7. Dakota, I. Ayuningtyas, D. Oktarina, R. Misnaniarti. Implementasi Kebijakan Remunerasi Di Rumah Sakit Pemerintah. *Indonesian Journal of Health Policy Vol. 06 No. 03/ September 2017/ page 159-166*